SWIND STATES TO A SERVING STATES TO A SERVING

UNITED STATES ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY

REGION 5
77 WEST JACKSON BOULEVARD
CHICAGO, IL 60604-3590
July 19, 2022

REPLY TO THE ATTENTION OF

VIA ELECTRONIC MAIL

Ms. Amber Kelly Registered Agent Kelly Painting Services, LLC 1526 Wittlou Avenue Cincinnati, Ohio 45224

ajfry0823@gmail.com

Re: Consent Agreement and Final Order – In the Matter of:

Kelly Painting Services, LLC, Docket No. TSCA-05-2022-0008

Dear Ms. Kelly:

Enclosed please find a copy of a fully executed Consent Agreement and Final Order in resolution of the above case. This document was filed on ______ July 19, 2022 _____ with the Regional Hearing Clerk.

The civil penalty in the amount of \$1,086 is to be paid in the manner described in paragraphs 65 and 66. Please be certain that the docket number is written on both the transmittal letter and on the check.

Thank you for your cooperation in resolving this matter.

Sincerely,

MICHAEL Digitally signed by MICHAEL TODD Date: 2022.06.30 13:52:12 -05'00'

Michael Todd Enforcement Officer Pesticides and Toxics Compliance Section

Attachments

cc: Maria Dambriunas (C-14J)

UNITED STATES ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY REGION 5

In the Matter of:) Docket No. TSCA-05-2022-0008
Kelly Painting Services, LLC) Proceeding to Assess a Civil
Cincinnati, Ohio) Penalty Under Section 16(a) of the
) Toxic Substances Control Act,
Respondent.) 15 U.S.C. § 2615(a)
)

Consent Agreement and Final Order

Preliminary Statement

- 1. This is an administrative action commenced and concluded under Section 16(a) of the Toxic Substances Control Act (TSCA), 15 U.S.C. § 2615(a), and Sections 22.1(a)(5), 22.13(b), and 22.18(b)(2) and (3) of the Consolidated Rules of Practice Governing the Administrative Assessment of Civil Penalties and the Revocation/ Termination or Suspension of Permits (Consolidated Rules), as codified at 40 C.F.R. Part 22.
- 2. The Complainant is, by lawful delegation, the Director of the Enforcement and Compliance Assurance Division, U.S. Environmental Protection Agency (EPA), Region 5.
- 3. Respondent is Kelly Painting Services, LLC, with a place of business located at 1526 Wittlou Avenue, Cincinnati, Ohio 45224.
- 4. Where the parties agree to settle one or more causes of action before the filing of a complaint, the administrative action may be commenced and concluded simultaneously by the issuance of a consent agreement and final order (CAFO). 40 C.F.R. § 22.13(b).
- 5. The parties agree that settling this action without the filing of a complaint or the adjudication of any issue of fact or law is in their interest and in the public interest.

6. Respondent consents to the terms of this CAFO, including the assessment of the civil penalty specified below.

Jurisdiction and Waiver of Right to Hearing

- 7. Respondent admits the jurisdictional allegations set forth in this CAFO.
- 8. Respondent neither admits nor denies the specific factual allegations and legal conclusions set forth in this CAFO.
- 9. Respondent waives any and all remedies, claims for relief, and otherwise available rights to judicial or administrative review that Respondent may have with respect to any issue of fact or law set forth in this CAFO, including its right to request a hearing or petition for judicial review under Section 16(a) of TSCA, 15 U.S.C. § 2615(a), and under 40 C.F.R. § 22.15(c), its right to seek federal judicial review of the CAFO pursuant to Chapter 7 of the Administrative Procedure Act, 5 U.S.C. §§ 701-06, any right to contest the allegations in this CAFO, and its right to appeal this CAFO. Respondent also consents to the issuance of this CAFO without further adjudication.

Statutory and Regulatory Background

10. In promulgating the Residential Lead-Based Paint Hazard Reduction Act of 1992, Pub. L. No. 102-550, Oct. 28, 1998 (Title X), Congress found, among other things, that low-level lead poisoning was widespread among American children, afflicting as many as 3,000,000 children under age six (6); at low levels, lead poisoning in children causes intelligence quotient deficiencies, reading and learning disabilities, impaired hearing, reduced attention span, hyperactivity, and behavior problems; and the ingestion of household dust containing lead from deteriorating or abraded lead-based paint is the most common cause of lead poisoning in children. A key component of the national strategy to reduce and eliminate the threat of

childhood lead poisoning is to educate the public concerning the hazards and sources of lead-based paint poisoning and steps to reduce and eliminate such hazards. *See* 42 U.S.C. § 4851.

- 11. Section 1021 of the Residential Lead-Based Paint Hazard Reduction Act of 1992 amended TSCA, 15 U.S.C. § 2601 *et seq.*, by adding Subchapter IV Lead Exposure Reduction, 15 U.S.C. §§ 2681 through 2692.
- 12. Section 402(a) of TSCA, 15 U.S.C. § 2682, requires the Administrator of EPA to promulgate regulations to ensure that individuals engaged in lead-based paint activities are properly trained; that training programs are accredited; that contractors engaged in such activities are certified; and that such regulations contain standards for performing lead-based paint activities, taking into account reliability, effectiveness, and safety.
- 13. Section 402(c) of TSCA, 15 U.S.C. § 2682, requires the Administrator of EPA to promulgate guidelines for the conduct of renovation and remodeling activities to reduce the risk of exposure to lead in connection with renovation and remodeling of target housing and public buildings built before 1978, and commercial buildings, and to revise the regulations under Section 402(a) of TSCA to apply those regulations to renovation or remodeling activities in target housing, public buildings constructed before 1978, and commercial buildings that create lead-based paint hazards.
- 14. Section 407 of TSCA, 15 U.S.C. § 2687, requires the regulations promulgated by the Administrator of EPA under Subchapter IV to include such recordkeeping and reporting requirements as may be necessary to insure the effective implementation of the TSCA Lead Exposure Reduction requirements, 15 U.S.C. §§ 2681 through 2692.
- 15. Section 11 of TSCA, 15 U.S.C. § 2610, provides EPA with authority to conduct inspections upon the presentation of appropriate credentials and written notice.

- 16. Under Section 409 of TSCA, 15 U.S.C. § 2689, it shall be unlawful for any person to fail or refuse to comply with any rule or order issued under Subchapter IV Lead Exposure Reduction, 15 U.S.C. §§ 2681 through 2692. *See also* 40 C.F.R. § 745.87.
- 17. Under Section 15 of TSCA, 15 U.S.C. § 2614, it shall be unlawful for any person to fail or refuse to establish and maintain records, submit reports, notices, or other information, or permit access to or copying of records, as required by TSCA or a rule thereunder. *See also* 40 C.F.R. § 745.87.
- 18. Pursuant to Sections 402, 406, and 407 of TSCA, 15 U.S.C. §§ 2682, 2686, and 2687, EPA promulgated the residential property renovation regulations at 40 C.F.R. Part 745, Subpart E, prescribing procedures and requirements for: the accreditation of renovator training programs; certification of individuals and firms engaged in lead-based paint activities; work practice standards for renovation, repair and painting activities in target housing and child-occupied facilities; and recordkeeping to demonstrate compliance with work practice standards. 73 Fed. Reg. 21691 (April 22, 2008).
- 19. 40 C.F.R. § 745.82(a) provides that Subpart E applies to all renovations performed in target housing and child-occupied facilities, with certain exceptions not relevant here.
- 20. 40 C.F.R. § 745.83 defines *firm* to mean a company, partnership, corporation, sole proprietorship, or individual doing business, association, or other business entity; a Federal, State, Tribal, or local government agency; or a nonprofit organization.
- 21. 40 C.F.R. § 745.83 defines *renovation* to mean the modification of any existing structure, or portion thereof, that results in the disturbance of painted surfaces, unless that activity is performed as part of an abatement as defined by this part (40 C.F.R. § 745.223). The term renovation includes (but is not limited to): the removal, modification or repair of painted

surfaces or painted components; the removal of building components; weatherization projects; and interim controls that disturb painted surfaces.

- 22. 40 C.F.R. § 745.83 defines *renovator* to mean an individual who either performs or directs workers who perform renovations. A certified renovator is a renovator who has successfully completed a renovator course accredited by EPA or an EPA authorized State or Tribal Program.
- 23. 40 C.F.R. § 745.103 defines *residential dwelling* to mean a single-family dwelling, including attached structures such as porches and stoops; or a single-family dwelling unit in a structure that contains more than one separate residential dwelling unit, and in which each such unit is used or occupied, or intended to be used or occupied, in whole or in part, as the residence of one or more persons.
- 24. 40 C.F.R. § 745.103 defines *target housing* to mean any housing constructed prior to 1978, except housing for the elderly or persons with disabilities (unless any child who is less than six (6) years of age resides or is expected to reside in such housing) or any zero-bedroom dwelling.
- 25. 40 C.F.R. § 745.81(a)(2)(ii) requires that on or after April 22, 2010, no firm may perform, offer, or claim to perform renovations without certification from EPA under 40 C.F.R. § 745.89 in target housing or child occupied facilities, unless the renovation qualifies for one of the exceptions identified in 40 C.F.R. § 745.82(a).
- 26. 40 C.F.R. § 745.85(a) requires that renovations must be performed by certified firms, in accordance with 40 C.F.R. § 745.89, using certified renovators in accordance with 40 C.F.R. § 745.90.

- 27. 40 C.F.R. § 745.89(d)(1) requires the firm performing the renovation to ensure that all individuals performing renovation activities on behalf of the firm are either certified renovators or have been trained by a certified renovator in accordance with 40 C.F.R. § 745.90.
- 28. 40 C.F.R. § 745.89(d)(2) requires that a certified renovator is assigned to each renovation perform by the firm and discharges all of the certified renovator responsibilities identified in 40 C.F.R. § 745.90.
- 29. 40 C.F.R. § 745.84(a)(1) requires that no more than sixty days before beginning a renovation activity in any dwelling unit of target housing, the firm performing a renovation must provide the owner of the unit with the pamphlet, and either obtain from the owner written acknowledgement of receipt of the pamphlet, or obtain a certificate of mailing at least seven days prior to the renovation.
- 30. 40 C.F.R. § 745.86(a) requires firms performing renovations to retain and, if requested, make available to EPA all records necessary to demonstrate compliance with 40 C.F.R. Part 745, Subpart E for a period of three years following completion of the renovation.
- 31. 40 C.F.R. § 745.86(b)(6) requires a firm to retain records that document compliance with the work practice standards in 40 C.F.R. § 745.85, including documentation that a certified renovator was assigned to the project, that the certified renovator provided on-the-job training for workers used on the project, that the certified renovator performed or directed workers who performed all of the tasks described in § 745.85(a), and that the certified renovator performed the post-renovation cleaning verification described in § 745.85(b).
- 32. 40 C.F.R. § 745.87(b) requires firms performing renovations to establish and maintain records and make them available or permit access to or copying of records.

- 33. Under 15 U.S.C. § 1689 and 40 C.F.R. § 745.87(a), failing to comply with any requirement of 40 C.F.R. Part 745, Subpart E, violates Section 409 of TSCA, 15 U.S.C. § 2689, which may subject the violator to administrative penalties under Section 16(a) of TSCA, 15 U.S.C. § 2615(a) and 40 C.F.R. § 745.87(d).
- 34. Section 16(a) of TSCA, 15 U.S.C. § 2615(a), 40 C.F.R. § 745.87(d), and 40 C.F.R. Part 19, authorize the Administrator of EPA to assess a civil penalty of up to \$43,611 per violation for each day of violation of Sections 15 and 409 of TSCA that occurred after November 2, 2015, where penalties are assessed on or after January 12, 2022.

General Allegations

- 35. Complainant incorporates paragraphs 1 through 34 of this CAFO as if set forth in this paragraph.
- 36. At all times relevant to this CAFO, Respondent was a firm as defined by 40 C.F.R. § 745.83.
- 37. On December 28, 2020, EPA issued the Respondent a "Request for Information under 40 C.F.R. § 745.86" letter dated December 11, 2020 seeking, among other things, a copy of the renovator certification showing completion of an EPA accredited training course, a copy of the firm certification received by EPA, copies of all contracts and/or agreements for renovation (contracts), copies of all acknowledgements of receipt of a pamphlet by the owners and occupants of residential housing and renovation records maintained as required by the Lead Renovation, Repair and Painting Rule (RRP).
- 38. On March 15, 2021 and March 25, 2021, Respondent provided Complainant via electronic mail documents requested by the Complainant in the "Request for Information under 40 C.F.R. § 745.86" letter dated December 11, 2020.

- 39. On April 20, 2022, Respondent was issued a firm certification (Certificate Number NAT-F235573-1) and provided the firm certification records via electronic mail to the Complainant.
- 40. Based on information provided to Complainant by Respondent and building-year information publicly available on the Hamilton County property value assessment website (accessed on May 18, 2021) the Respondent performed or directed workers to perform for compensation, the following modifications of existing structures that resulted in disturbances of painted surfaces in the following residential housing built prior to 1978, as detailed in this Table:

Line No.	Residential Property Address	Residence Type	Built Year	Contract Date	Contracted Work
1	4141 Georgia Avenue Cincinnati, OH 45223	Single-Family	1906	8/7/2020	Exterior Painting
2	1554 Oak Knoll Drive Cincinnati, OH 45224	Single-Family	1939	7/8/2020	Exterior Painting

- 41. On December 10, 2021, Respondent provided evidence from the occupant of the 4141 Georgia Avenue property in Paragraph 40 that no children under the age of 6 years old or pregnant people were present at the property during the renovation.
- 42. At the two contracted renovations referenced in Paragraph 40, Respondent performed or directed to perform modifications of the buildings' existing structures that resulted in disturbance of painted surfaces and were therefore renovations as defined in 40 C.F.R.§ 745.83.
- 43. The two renovations referenced in Paragraph 40 were each performed at residential housing built prior to 1978, and therefore the residential housing was target housing as defined in 40 C.F.R. § 745.103.

Count 1 – Failure to Obtain Firm Certification

- 44. Complainant incorporates Paragraphs 1 through 43 of this CAFO as if set forth in this paragraph.
- 45. 40 C.F.R. § 745.81(a)(2)(ii) requires firms that perform, offer, or claim to perform renovations for compensation to obtain firm certification from EPA pursuant to 40 C.F.R. § 745.89.
- 46. Respondent was not certified as a firm, under 40 C.F.R. § 745.89, during each renovation described in Paragraph 40 and did not qualify for an exemption under 40 C.F.R. § 745.82(a).
- 47. Respondent's performance of each renovation, as described in Paragraph 40, without certification from EPA constitutes a violation of 40 C.F.R. § 745.81(a)(2)(ii), 40 C.F.R. § 745.87(a), and 15 U.S.C. § 2689.

Count 2 to 3- Failure to Assign a Certified Renovator to the Renovation Projects

- 48. Complainant incorporates Paragraphs 1 through 43 of this CAFO as if set forth in this paragraph.
- 49. 40 C.F.R. § 745.89(d)(1) requires the firm performing the renovation to ensure that all individuals performing renovation activities on behalf of the firm are either certified renovators or have been trained by a certified renovator in accordance with 40 C.F.R. § 745.90.
- 50. Respondent performed or directed to perform each renovation described in Paragraph 40 and did not assign a certified renovator to the renovations.
- 51. Respondent's failure to ensure that a certified renovator was assigned to each renovation described in Paragraph 40 constitutes two violations of 40 C.F.R. § 745.89(d)(1), 40 C.F.R. § 745.87(a), and 15 U.S.C. § 2689.

Count 4 to 5 – Failure of a Firm to Carry out its Responsibilities During a Renovation

- 52. Complainant incorporates Paragraphs 1 through 43 of this Complaint as if set forth in this paragraph.
- 53. 40 C.F.R. § 745.89(d)(2) requires that a certified renovator is assigned to each renovation performed by the firm and discharges all of the certified renovator responsibilities identified in 40 C.F.R. § 745.90.
- 54. Respondent failed to ensure a certified renovator was on-site to perform the renovation activities or train workers to discharge all of the certified renovator responsibilities identified in 40 C.F.R. § 745.90, during each renovation described in Paragraph 40.
- 55. Respondent's failure to ensure a certified renovator was on-site to perform the renovation activities or train workers to discharge all of the certified renovator responsibilities identified in 40 C.F.R. § 745.90, during each renovation described in Paragraph 40, constitutes two violations of 40 C.F.R. § 745.89(d)(2), 40 C.F.R. § 745.87(a), and 15 U.S.C. § 2689.

Counts 6 to 7- Failure to Obtain Written Acknowledgement From Owners

- 56. Complainant incorporates Paragraphs 1 through 43 of this CAFO as if set forth in this paragraph.
- 57. 40 C.F.R. § 745.84(a)(1) requires that no more than sixty days before beginning a renovation activity in any dwelling unit of target housing, the firm performing a renovation must provide the owner of the unit with the pamphlet, and either obtain from the owner written acknowledgement of receipt of the pamphlet, or obtain a certificate of mailing at least seven days prior to the renovation.
- 58. Respondent performed contracted renovations at two locations of single-family residential housing as described in the table in Paragraph 40 and failed to obtain from each

owner the written acknowledgement that the owners had received the pamphlet or a certificate of mailing at least seven days prior to the renovation as required by 40 C.F.R. § 745.84(a)(1).

59. Respondent's failure to provide the owner of the two dwelling units described in Paragraph 40 with the EPA-approved lead hazard informational pamphlet entitled "Renovate Right: Important Lead Hazard Information for Families Child Care Providers, and Schools" no more than 60 days before beginning renovation activities constitutes two violations of 40 C.F.R. § 745.84(a)(1), 40 C.F.R. § 745.87(a), and 15 U.S.C. § 2689.

Counts 8 to 9 – Failure to Retain All Records Necessary to Demonstrate Compliance with 40 C.F.R. Part 745, Subpart E

- 60. Complainant incorporates Paragraphs 1 through 43 of this CAFO as if set forth in this paragraph.
- 61. In the two renovations described in Paragraph 40, Respondent failed to establish and maintain all records necessary to demonstrate compliance with 40 C.F.R. Part 745, Subpart E for a period of three years following completion of each renovation.
- 62. In the two renovations described in Paragraph 40 Respondent failed to establish and maintain the following records:
 - a. Documentation of compliance with the work practice standards in 40 C.F.R.
 § 745.85,
 - b. Documentation that a certified renovator was assigned to the project,
 - Documentation that the certified renovator provided on-the-job training for workers used on the project,
 - d. Documentation that the certified renovator performed or directed workers who performed all of the tasks described in 40 C.F.R. § 745.85(a), and

e. Documentation that the certified renovator performed the post-renovation cleaning verification described in 40 C.F.R. § 745.85(b).

63. Respondent's failure to establish and maintain all records necessary to demonstrate compliance with 40 C.F.R. Part 745, Subpart E for a period of three years following the completion of each renovation described in Paragraph 40 constitutes two violations of 40 C.F.R. § 745.86(b)(6), 40 C.F.R. § 745.87(a), and 15 U.S.C. § 2689.

Civil Penalty

64. Pursuant to Section 16(a) of TSCA, 15 U.S.C. § 2615(a), Complainant determined that an appropriate civil penalty to settle this action is \$1,086. In determining the penalty amount, Complainant considered the nature, circumstances, extent and gravity of the violations alleged and, with respect to Respondent, ability to pay, effect on ability to continue to do business, any history of prior such violations, the degree of culpability, and such other factors as justice may require.

65. Within 30 days after the effective date of this CAFO, Respondent must pay the civil \$1,086 penalty for the TSCA violations by sending a cashier's or certified check, payable to "Treasurer, United States of America," to:

U.S. EPA
Fines and Penalties
Cincinnati Finance Center
P.O. Box 979077
St. Louis, Missouri 63197-9000

The check must state Respondent's name and the docket number of this CAFO.

66. Respondent must send a notice of payment that states Respondent's name and the case docket number to EPA at the following addresses when it pays the penalty:

Regional Hearing Clerk (E-19J)
R5hearingclerk@epa.gov

Michael Todd (ECP-17J) todd.michael@epa.gov

Maria Dambriunas (C-14J) dambriunas.maria@epa.gov

- 67. This civil penalty is not deductible for federal tax purposes.
- 68. If Respondent does not timely pay the civil penalty, EPA may refer this matter to the Attorney General, who will recover such amount, plus interest, in the appropriate district court of the United States under Section 16(a) of TSCA, 15 U.S.C. § 2615(a). Respondent acknowledges that the validity, amount, and appropriateness of the civil penalty are not reviewable in a collection action.
- 69. Pursuant to 31 C.F.R. § 901.9, Respondent must pay the following on any amount overdue under this CAFO. Interest will accrue on any amount overdue from the date the payment was due at a rate established pursuant to 31 U.S.C. § 3717. Respondent must pay a \$15 handling charge each month that any portion of the penalty is more than 30 days past due. In addition, Respondent must pay a 6 percent per year penalty on any principal amount 90 days past due.

General Provisions

- 70. The parties consent to service of this CAFO by e-mail at the following valid e-mail addresses: dambriunas.maria@epa.gov (for Complainant), and ajfry0823@gmail.com (for Respondent). Respondent understands that the CAFO will become publicly available upon filing.
- 71. Respondent's full compliance with this CAFO shall only resolve Respondent's liability for federal civil penalties for the violations alleged in the CAFO.
- 72. This CAFO does not affect the rights of EPA or the United States to pursue appropriate injunctive or other equitable relief or criminal sanctions for any violations of law.

- 73. This CAFO does not affect Respondent's responsibility to comply with TSCA, the Residential Lead-Based Paint Hazard Reduction Act of 1992, the Residential Lead-Based Paint Disclosure Program, and other applicable federal, state, and local laws.
 - 74. Respondent certifies that it is complying with TSCA and 40 C.F.R. Part 745.
- 75. This CAFO constitutes a "prior such violation" as that term is used in EPA's Interim Final Consolidated Enforcement Response and Penalty Policy for the Pre-Renovation Education Rule; Renovation, Repair and Painting Rule; and Lead-Based Paint Activities Rule to determine Respondent's "history of prior such violations" under Section 16(a)(2)(B) of TSCA, 15 U.S.C. § 2615(a)(2)(B).
 - 76. The terms of this CAFO bind Respondent, and its successors and assigns.
- 77. Each person signing this agreement certifies that he or she has the authority to sign for the party whom he or she represents and to bind that party to its terms.
 - 78. Each party agrees to bear its own costs and attorney's fees in this action.
 - 79. This CAFO constitutes the entire agreement between the parties.
- 80. The effective date of this CAFO is the date on which it is filed with the Regional Hearing Clerk.

Consent Agreement and Final Order In the Matter of: Kelly Painting Services, LLC Docket No. TSCA-05-2022-0008

Kelly Painting Services, LLC, Respondent

Ms. Amber Kelly

Registered Agent

Kelly Painting Services, LLC

Consent Agreement and Final Order
In the Matter of: Kelly Painting Services, LLC

Docket No. TSCA-05-2022-0008

United States Environmental Protection Agency, Complainant

MICHAEL
HARRIS
Digitally signed by MICHAEL
HARRIS
Date: 2022.07.12 11:13:03
-05'00'

Michael D. Harris Division Director Enforcement and Compliance Assurance Division Consent Agreement and Final Order

In the Matter of: Kelly Painting Services, LLC

Docket No. TSCA-05-2022-0008

Final Order

This Consent Agreement and Final Order, as agreed to by the parties, shall become effective immediately upon filing with the Regional Hearing Clerk. This Final Order concludes this proceeding pursuant to 40 C.F.R. §§ 22.18 and 22.31. IT IS SO ORDERED.



Ann L. Coyle Regional Judicial Officer United States Environmental Protection Agency Region 5

Consent Agreement and Final Order In the Matter of: Kelly Painting Services, LLC Docket Number: TSCA-05-2022-0008

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

		egoing Consent Agreement and Final, this day in the following manner to
the addressees:	<i>y</i>	
Copy by e-mail to		
Respondent:	Ms. Amber Kelly	
	Registered Agent	
	Kelly Painting Se	
	1526 Wittlou Av	
	Cincinnati, Ohio	45224
	ajfry0823@gmai	1.com
Copy by e-mail to		
Attorney for Complainant:	Maria Dambriuna	as
J 1	dambriunas.mari	a@epa.gov
Copy by e-mail to		
Regional Judicial Officer:	Ann Coyle	
	coyle.ann@epa.g	gov
Taidaa Maadinaa		
Isidra Martinez	_	
Acting Regional Hearing Clerk		
U.S. Environmental Protection	Agency, Kegion 5	